

## BOOK REVIEWS

Viqar Ahmad and Rashid Amjad: *The management of Pakistan's Economy, 1947-82*, (Oxford University Press, Karachi, 1984) pp. xi + 315, n/p.

This book attempts to investigate and analyse the factors responsible for the formulation and implementation of the economic policies followed in Pakistan during 1947-82 which are responsible in many ways for creating the economic situation in which the country finds itself today.

The book begins with a discussion of the macro framework and the process of economic decision-making and power groups influencing such decision-making. This is followed by five chapters on various issues related to agriculture, and four chapters on industrial and commercial policies issues. Financing of economic development, based on fiscal and monetary management and impact of foreign aid, winds up the book.

Initial chapters present a fairly detailed view of Pakistan's economic performance 1947-82; a comparison of the basic parameters of overall socio-economic conditions as inherited in 1947 and the situation in which the country finds itself in 1982, proves to be a meaningful starting point. Further, inter-country comparisons of key economic variables are useful in demonstrating Pakistan's status in an international framework.

The chapter on social services is well-equipped with expenditure/facilities data and analysis regarding education, health, housing, and other sub-sectors. However, one feels the neglect of the following issues with reference to the education and health sectors:

- 1) Unlike the detailed analysis of industrial nationalization (p. 219), except for a very brief reference (p. 29), there is no discussion of the impact of nationalization of educational institutions on educational standards. Similarly, reference to another recent policy issue, i.e., a switch to generic drug names in 1970s, and its impact on health services, would have been interesting.
- 2) There is no discussion/data of the non-allopathic (hakeems, homeopaths, informal healers, etc.), health service provisions. It may be noted that these form an important component of health facilities available in rural sector, and should be taken into consideration before any meaningful health policy can be formulated.

- 3) The crucial problem of massive unemployment amongst urban medical graduates (according to news media, thousands of doctors are unemployed today) is ignored.

The book divides Pakistan's economic history until 1982 into four distinct phases, which coincide closely with particular forms of political governments which existed during those periods: the period of the fifties, when the newly independent country was administered by a parliamentary form of government; the period of the sixties, when the country was ruled by a military dictatorship which converted itself into a presidential system of government based on limited franchise; the period, 1972-77, when there was a return to a parliamentary system of government; and finally, 1977-82, when there has been a return to martial law and military government. Very ably, the authors have succeeded in outlining the major economic developments during each phase, and linking them to the key economic decisions, and factors influencing these decisions.

In the context of economic decision making, there is detailed decade-wise discussion on planning issues. However, since the book is to serve as a text book, it would have been helpful if chapters on issues related to planning could have ended with a summary table of the planning experience, 1947-82, with dates of the five-year plans, allocations and expenditures, targets and achievements with respect to major sectors of the economy.

In chapters related to agriculture, the book has done full justice to the primary sector. Besides trends in agriculture, policy framework, resource base, and productivity trends in major crops, there is a detailed discussion of related issues such as land reforms, agricultural inputs, particularly water and fertilizer, agricultural price policy, and various institutions including taxation, credit, marketing and extension services. A well-referenced debate on agricultural mechanization in Pakistan makes interesting reading. However, in the context of rural development, data on certain infrastructural indices, such as length of roads, number of villages electrified, number of co-operative societies, etc., would have provided the reader with a clearer picture of rural development over time.

Similar to the primary sector issues, issues related to industrial sector's development are presented in detail. Both theoretical and empirical techniques are used to analyse the problem of monopoly power and the concentration of industrial ownership in the sixties. Nationalization of heavy industries and its impact on industrial performance, and the role of small-scale sector in overall industrial strategy are discussed at length.

The book, however, fails to adequately incorporate the contributions of former East Pakistan towards the economic development of the country. Since this was the majority province till 1971, it deserved better coverage than the one extended to it. Although the former East Pakistan has been

referred to in the context of inter-regional income disparities (pp. 88-89) and the dispute between the economists in East and West Pakistan over the extent of these disparities, yet there is little discussion of the contributions made by the eastern wing in agricultural productivity or industrialization.

Referring to the arguments presented by West Pakistan economists, the book states (p. 89).

“They further argued that a major cause of the widening economic disparity was the high rate of agricultural growth which the West had experienced in the sixties rather than a lower level of investment in the East.”

Despite this, the book fails to mention the factors responsible for the relative failure of the green revolution in former East Pakistan, or quote any data/discussion as to the extent of the adoption of the new seed-water-fertilizer technology in that wing.

Also, Bangladesh could have been included in the inter-country comparisons of key economic variables (p. 12).

Overall, this 315 page book traces a comprehensive image of Pakistan's economy, its sectoral priorities, policies and achievements. It is well-organized, and provides adequate references to detailed studies on various issues. It is evident that after considerable research and effort, the authors have succeeded in producing not only a valuable addition to the literature on Pakistan economics, but an invaluable text book for college students.

*Eshya Mujabid*

*Applied Economics Research Centre  
University of Karachi*

Hamza Alavi, and Teodor Shanin, (editors), *Introduction to the sociology of “developing societies”*, (Macmillan, London, 1982), pp. xii + 474, n/p.

Issues pertaining to development are not the sole domain of economists, a fact that members of the professional and academic economics fraternity have too often tended to forget. This book, the first of a highly commendable if somewhat ambitious nine volume series, sets out to show that if one is to understand the totality of the subject of “developing societies”, one must take into account the relevant contribution of sociologists, social an-

thropologists, historians, political scientists, literary critics, cultural commentators as well as economists. Pure economic explanations and understanding of culturally, socially, and politically loaded concepts such as development and underdevelopment can no longer be considered sufficient.

This relatively young tradition, known as the sociology of development, has risen out of the failure of modernization theory in achieving its postulates, namely of sustained growth through a uniform and linear process of trickle down of technology, capital and expertise from the developed to the underdeveloped nations, during the mid 1960s. In place of this discredited ahistorical approach has come an alternative which emphasizes a historical understanding of the causes of underdevelopment along with the internal and external factors that continue to maintain this state. It recognises that "development" is no isolated phenomena; at the macro level it is linked to issues affecting international markets, institutions and the world economy; while at the micro level it is tied to social, cultural, and community development. A common thread that runs through the sociology of development tradition is the political economy mode of analysis. Rooted in Marx's works it holds that change comes about through the interaction and struggle of competing classes at both national and international levels.

Within such a framework, the aim of the "*Sociology of developing societies*" series, of which six of the latter volumes are region specific, is to provide a carefully structured set of readings for the undergraduate level which encourage students and teachers alike to approach the subject within a spirit of debate.

The first volume, which serves as an introduction to the series, includes an extensive, accomplished and varied collection of readings. There are 34 papers in all (a few being no more than one to two page extracts) of which nine are published for the first time. They are divided into five sections dealing with the colonial experience and the emergence of developing societies; the external or global framework which governs them; their internal social formation and class relations; the social and class basis of the "post-colonial" state and the experience of popular resistance against internal and external domination; and finally the ideological and cultural aspects of development.

On the whole the collection is well thought out. The first section includes an excellent and succinct historical review of imperialism by Magdoff as well as a paper by Brenner which focusses on the debate that has ensued from the works of Frank and Wallerstein. In section II the pieces by Cardoso (on Dependency) and Alavi (on Peripheral Capitalism) deserve praise. On the other hand Barratt Brown's and Hymer's contributions are highly disappointing.

Section III has rather brief extracts from seminal works by Baran, Amin,

and Sweezy which really are insufficient given the importance of these works. Sweezy's work, in particular, deserves more extensive coverage. Bernstein's article focusses on the recent controversy generated by Warren's orthodox Marxist position on imperialism as the motive force behind capitalist development in the periphery.

The section on State and revolution has two excellent pieces by the editors. Alavi's paper is essentially an extension of his earlier seminal piece on the post-colonial state and the alliance of dominant classes within peripheral capitalism. Shanin's work looks at the revolutionary history and potential of workers and peasants, and the manner in which the post-colonial state undertakes social domination in its attempt to thwart revolutionary change. It is surprising that Ley's paper come so late in the volume. He provides an excellent critique of Huntington's "modernization" theory. Marquez, to end the section, gives a moving account of how the state and the dominant class alliance defeated the popular will with the military overthrow of the Allende Government in Chile.

The last section looks at what are essentially micro issues such as urban development (Roberts), the role of women and the sexual division of labour (Pine) and education (Dale). A rather brief extract from an earlier article by Nairn defines the role of nationalism within historical development. Given the importance of the 'national question' in the Third World, as shown by the preponderance of nationalist movements, it is a shame that the editors did not cover this issue in greater depth. The 'national question' (as distinct from national chauvinism) remains much neglected and underdeveloped within the Marxist school. The final essay in the volume is a lucid piece by Davidson on colonial and post-colonial ideology, especially the changes in historical perception of the colonised peoples by the colonisers. Davidson concludes his essay by advocating the position of "solidarity with the Third World" by attempting to study their specific problems rather than laying down rigid doctrinaire and theoretical models of social transition for "developing societies" to unquestioningly follow.

One feels at the end that in their attempt to provide an introductory framework to the sociology of development, the editors have included far too many papers, some so short that they fail in making their point or doing justice to the original works from which they have been extracted. Furthermore, it is sad to reflect on the fact that of the thirty odd papers in all, only nine are being published for the first time. Finally, the editors fail to clearly define and structure the readings; each section could be improved if an expanded introduction to the issues to be raised within it were provided.

Despite these (relatively minor) drawbacks, the book is an excellent addition to the rapidly expanding literature on the subject and should form part of the recommended reading for undergraduate courses on development.

Although, one should hastily point out, it should not serve as a substitute for many of the original classics on “development and underdevelopment”. In the meantime we wait for the area specific texts; and in the case of our own regional bias, the volume on South Asia.

*Khalid Nadvi*

*Applied Economics Research Centre  
University of Karachi*